## STATE OF WASHINGTON

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION

MICHAEL HOLTE,

Complainant,

CASE 23788-U-11-6070

VS.

DECISION 11267-A - PECB

NORTHSHORE UTILITY DISTRICT,

Respondent.

**DECISION OF COMMISSION** 

The Rosen Law Firm, by Jon Howard Rosen, Attorney at Law, for the union.

Davis Grimm Payne & Marra, by Selena C. Smith, Attorney at Law, for the employer.

On February 4, 2011, Michael Holte (Holte/complainant) filed an unfair labor practice complaint against the Northshore Utility District (employer) alleging employer discrimination. Holte alleged employer discrimination for terminating him in reprisal for union activities and/or in reprisal for testifying in a prior unfair labor practice case. Examiner Charity Atchison held a hearing and determined that the employer did not commit an unfair labor practice. Holte now appeals that decision.

On appeal, the complainant makes several arguments, none of which we find persuasive. To address those arguments we incorporate the Examiner's applicable legal principles, analysis and conclusions here as we see no reason to restate them. The Examiner made appropriate credibility determinations and did not ignore relevant facts. We agree that Holte did not establish a causal connection between his testimony in an unfair labor practice and the employer laying him off. We agree that Holte did not establish a causal connection between being the union president at the time the union was decertified and being laid off.

Furthermore, although not an issue before us on appeal, it is important to note that we strongly agree with the Examiner's comment on the employer's post-hearing brief, which contained 36 footnotes on 20 of the 24 pages in an effort to thwart the 25 page limitation in WAC 391-45-290(2). In this case, we particularly agree with the Examiner's statement that:

Parties need not waste precious space in their briefs detailing the facts contained in the record that the Examiner reviews prior to issuing her decision. Briefs should focus on legal analysis.

We have reviewed the entire record and fully considered the parties' arguments. The Examiner correctly stated the legal standards. Substantial evidence supports the Examiner's challenged findings of fact, and those findings support the challenged conclusion of law. We affirm the Examiner's decision in its entirety. We find that the employer did not discriminate against Holte in reprisal for protected union activities or for testifying at an unfair labor practice hearing.

NOW, THEREFORE, it is

## <u>ORDERED</u>

The Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order of Examiner Charity Atchison are AFFIRMED and ADOPTED as the Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order of the Commission.

ISSUED at Olympia, Washington, this <u>21<sup>st</sup></u> day of September, 2012.

PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION

MARILYN GLEWN SAYAN, Chairperson

PAMELA G. BRADBURN, Commissioner

melo Diodom

THOMAS W. McLANE, Commissioner

# PERG STATE OF WASHINGTON

## PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS COMMISSION

112 HENRY STREET NE SUITE 300 PO BOX 40919 OLYMPIA, WASHINGTON 98504-0919 MARILYN GLENN SAYAN, CHAIRPERSON PAMELA G. BRADBURN, COMMISSIONER THOMAS W. McLANE, COMMISSIONER MIKE SELLARS, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

#### RECORD OF SERVICE - ISSUED 09/21/2012

The attached document identified as: DECISION 11267-A - PECB has been served by the Public Employment Relations Commission by deposit in the United States mail, on the date issued indicated above, postage prepaid, addressed to the parties and their representatives listed in the docket records of the Commission as indicated below:

PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS

ROBBIE

CASE NUMBER:

23788-U-11-06070

FILED:

02/04/2011

FILED BY:

PARTY 2

DISPUTE:

ER MULTIPLE ULP

BAR UNIT:

ALL EMPLOYEES see 23875-S-11-0209

DETAILS: COMMENTS:

EMPLOYER:

NORTHSHORE UTILITY DIST

ATTN:

**FANNY YEE** 

6830 NE 185TH ST PO BOX 82489

KENMORE, WA 98028-0489

Ph1: 425-398-4410 Ph2: 425-398-4400

REP BY:

SELENA SMITH

DAVIS GRIMM PAYNE MARRA

701 5TH AVE STE 4040 SEATTLE, WA 98104 Ph1: 206-447-0182

PARTY 2:

MICHAEL HOLTE

ATTN:

C/O JON HOWARD ROSEN THE ROSEN LAW FIRM 705 2ND AVE STE 1200 SEATTLE, WA 98104-1798

Ph1: 206-652-1464

REP BY:

JON ROSEN

THE ROSEN LAW FIRM 705 2ND AVE STE 1200 SEATTLE, WA 98104-1798

Ph1: 206-652-1464 Ph2: 206-682-6711