R v Bertrand, 2020 NWTSC 14

S-1-CR-2018-000143

# IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

**IN THE MATTER OF:** 

#### HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

-V-

### PETER BERTRAND

Transcript of the Reasons for Sentence of the Honourable Justice L.A. Charbonneau, sitting in Yellowknife, in the Northwest Territories, on the 9<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2020.

#### **APPEARANCES:**

M. Fane: Counsel for the Crown

L. Moore: Counsel for the Defence

Charge under s. 271 of the Criminal Code

There is a ban on the publication, broadcast or transmission of any information that could identify the complainant pursuant to s. 486.4 of the *Criminal Code* 

# <u>INDEX</u> **PAGE RULINGS, REASONS** Reasons for sentencing 1 Agreed Statement of Facts 12 i

1 THE COURT: I am going to give my decision now. My 2 more usual practice is to take some time to write and 3 try to explain my decisions in a bit more detail. But I 4 think in this case it probably is more important that this 5 matter be completed today so that there is no more 6 waiting for the outcome of this case. 7 I said it just last week how sad it is how 8 often this Court has to impose sentence on people for 9 the crime of sexual assault. 10 In this particular case, the victim of the 11 offence was a young person. I am going to direct that 12 a copy of the Agreed Statement of Facts be appended 13 to the transcript, and I am ordering a transcript, 14 because I do not want to repeat those facts now, but 15 that way it will be clear to anyone reading my decision 16 what the admitted facts were. 17 Adults are responsible for making sure 18 that they take all reasonable steps to determine 19 someone's age if there is any possibility that the person 20 may not be of age to give lawful consent to sexual 21 contact. 22 The facts here are, as far as I understood 23 from the submissions of counsel, somewhat 24 deliberately vague in the sense that there is no detail 25 about how the sexual contact really came to be. There 26 is some equivocation on Mr. Bertrand's part in the pre-27 sentence report that suggests to me that he at the time 1

viewed this as something consensual. The problem, of course, is if a person does not have the legal capacity to consent, the fact that they may have ostensibly consented is not a mitigating factor.

Lafferty, 2019 NWTSC 38 a few months ago, but in that case I did talk about the principles that govern sexual assault of young persons when the facts are that there was ostensible consent. In other words, the young person appeared to be going along with what was taking place. In that decision, I followed *R v Hajar*, 2016 ABCA 222, a decision from the Alberta Court of Appeal.

For today's purposes, I adopt what I said in my decision on *Lafferty*. The main point is that it is not a mitigating factor because at the end of the day, the adults are the ones who bear the responsibility in these matters.

That case also stood for the proposition that the starting point in these kinds of cases should be three years. I should say that the debate in *Hajar* was whether ostensible consent was a mitigating factor. I am saying all of this despite the fact that in this case it is not actually alleged that there was ostensible consent; the facts are just silent on that point. But even if there was, it is not a mitigating factor.

Another important principle in this matter

is that counsel have presented a joint submission. It is said frequently in our courts because joint submissions are presented on a fairly regular basis. The law that governs joint submissions is that the courts are required to follow them unless a judge thinks that the joint submission is completely unreasonable.

This joint submission, in my view, is not unreasonable because although the starting point is three years and although this is a very serious offence, there are also mitigating factors. The guilty plea is extremely mitigating. Guilty pleas are more mitigating when they happen sooner because that means that the victims do not live for months and months thinking they will have to testify in front of a jury, as was the case here.

In this case, the victim actually testified by videoconferencing at the preliminary hearing, but I heard from the Crown that the cross-examination at the preliminary hearing was mostly on peripheral matters. She did not have to answer questions about the details of what actually happened, the sexual act between her and Mr. Bertrand. So it sounds as though it was a cross-examination that would have been perhaps less difficult than what we sometimes see in preliminary hearings. It is never an easy thing to testify about these things, but as with everything else, there

1 are degrees. 2 She also lived with the belief that she 3 would have to testify in front of a jury, which must have 4 caused her a lot of anxiety. But as I said last week in another sentencing hearing, for having seen many 5 6 witnesses of all ages testify in sexual assault trials in 7 front of juries and sometimes in front of the judge, 8 sitting alone, I know very well that sparing someone 9 from having to do that is sparing them a lot because it 10 is an exceedingly difficult thing for most people to have 11 to talk about these kinds of matters in a public 12 courtroom. 13 And by pleading guilty, despite perhaps 14 his initial equivocation about who was responsible, Mr. 15 Bertrand has spared this young woman that ordeal, and 16 that is mitigating, I agree. 17 The other factor that has to be 18 considered by this Court is that Mr. Bertrand is 19 Indigenous. I will not try to summarize or paraphrase 20 the pre-sentence report because it is a very thorough 21 report and it would not do it justice for me to try to 22 summarize it, but I will say only that it is a very sad read 23 inasmuch as it relates to Mr. Bertrand's circumstances 24 growing up. The account of his being taken away to 25 residential school and seeing, as the plane flew away, 26 his grandmother crying on the riverbank is 27 heartbreaking. The description of the effect that this

1 had on him is also very sad. 2 This is something we hear about in the 3 courts from time to time, and it is part of why the 4 Supreme Court of Canada has said that this and other 5 systemic factors that have affected Indigenous people 6 in this country must be taken into account when 7 imposing sentence. It does not excuse criminal 8 behaviour, but it is something that is relevant to 9 people's blameworthiness, and when someone's moral 10 blameworthiness is reduced, that has an impact on 11 what sentence should be imposed because a sentence 12 should be proportionate to the seriousness of an 13 offence and the blameworthiness of the person who 14 committed it. 15 The guilty plea and Mr. Bertrand's 16 personal circumstances are reasons why I find that the 17 joint submission is reasonable in this case. 18 A two year less a day sentence, 19 especially for a man who spends a lot of time out on the 20 land and probably feeling more free than many others do when he is doing that, is not an insignificant 21 22 sentence. I expect for someone who is used to 23 spending a lot of time on the land, two years less a day, 24 or whatever time it ends up being in jail, is going to be 25 very difficult. And it does not make me happy to have 26 to impose that type of a sentence to anyone and 27 certainly does not make me happy to have to impose it

1 to you, Mr. Bertrand. 2 But what you did was very serious. 3 Young people need the protection of adults, and the 4 adults are the ones who have to know better and who 5 have to be extremely cautious, alcohol or no alcohol. 6 And so that is why the sentences for these types of 7 crimes are fairly severe. 8 I am going to also impose the various 9 orders that the Crown has sought because they are 10 mandatory. There will be a 20-year requirement to 11 comply with the Sex Offender Information Registration 12 Act, and a DNA order. A firearms prohibition order is 13 mandatory as well, but it is obvious to me that the 14 exemption should be included in it so that when you do 15 regain your freedom, Mr. Bertrand, you are able to 16 apply to have that firearm prohibition lifted so that you 17 can go back to your camp and you can lead what sounds to me is a very healthy lifestyle for you. I hope 18 19 that you are able to find someone to close up your 20 camp and look after things until you can return. 21 I will also impose a three-year probation 22 order. It will be supervised probation. Mr. Bertrand, 23 you will have to report to a probation officer within 48 24 hours of your release and thereafter as directed. I hope 25 and expect that that probation officer will take into 26 account where you are living and what your 27 circumstances are to not make this reporting a burden 6

1 but more something to help you. 2 I will include a condition that you take 3 counselling as recommended because that may assist 4 you. You do not sound like you have had a major 5 problem with alcohol, but it certainly sounds like it has 6 the potential of taking all your judgment away, if I can 7 put it that way. So that condition is there in the hopes 8 that it will help you. 9 There will be a condition that you have no contact with this young woman for the duration of the 10 11 probation order. 12 I am not going to make an alcohol 13 abstention condition. I think it is better to leave that up 14 to you. It does not sound like alcohol is necessarily a 15 frequent problem, but it also sounds like it is not a great 16 thing for you. But I will not include that specific 17 condition because at your age, I think you can make those choices. In light of what has happened, I think 18 19 you know better than anyone that it is not a good idea. 20 I will include a condition that you not be 21 alone with a person under 16 unless there is another 22 sober adult present. Based on everything I heard, it 23 does not sound like that is going to be a problem. If it 24 becomes a problem, there are ways to get probation 25 orders amended, and Mr. Moore can tell you how to do 26 that, but if there is ever a need to change this condition 27 because it has become too difficult with family

1	members or things of that nature, you can contact	
2	Legal Aid and arrangements can be made to bring it	
3	back before a judge to decide. But the condition will be	
4	included for now.	
5	I will also make an order that exhibits be	
6	returned to their rightful owner if that is appropriate, and	
7	if not, they can be destroyed. But this should be at the	
8	expiration of the appeal period if no appeal is brought.	
9	Mr. Bertrand, I wanted you to know that I	
10	would accept the joint submission, but I should have	
11	asked you, before I started giving this decision, if there	
12	was anything that you want to say. You get the last	
13	word or almost the last word in these proceedings. Mr.	
14	Moore has spoken on your behalf very well. If there is	
15	something you want to say, this is your chance. If you	
16	do not want to say anything, you do not have to.	
17	Is there anything you would like to tell	
18	me?	
19	THE ACCUSED: It's hard for me to express myself,	
20	express my regrets.	
21	THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.	
22	THE ACCUSED: This is going to have a big impact on	
23	my family, especially my mom. She's an elderly lady,	
24	and she is living alone. And once in a while when I	
25	come into the Fort Liard area I stay at her place and I	
26	help her, keeping the house warm, washing the dishes,	
27	and just doing whatever I can for her and I usually	
	8	

1	supply, like fish and	
2	THE COURT: Food.	
3	THE ACCUSED: you know, rabbits and it's going to	
4	have a big impact on her.	
5	THE COURT: I understand. And I have a feeling that	
6	for you, that is the worst punishment. I hope that others	
7	can chip in in the community of Fort Liard to help her	
8	and help you get your camp closed up.	
9	It was mentioned in the pre-sentence	
10	report, and Mr. Moore said it again this afternoon, that	
11	one of the things that you struggle with is the	
12	perception that people have of you now, that that	
13	perception may have changed. And that is probably	
14	true, that people's perceptions have changed. But you	
15	will be back in your community at the end of your	
16	sentence, and I hope that you are able to gain that	
17	respect back. You have done a lot of things in your life	
18	that commanded the respect you had of people before.	
19	I believe that most people understand that we make	
20	mistakes. This was a very bad one, but I hope that	
21	when you return to your community you are able to	
22	build on everything you have done in your life up to that	
23	day and regain that respect and be a role model for	
24	people.	
25	There are not that many people who lead	
26	a traditional lifestyle and have the skills that you have. I	
27	am sure you can help teach others, and there are a lot	
	۵	

1	of positive things you can do in your community after		
2	you return. So this does not have to be the end of that		
3	contribution you have been able to make to your		
4	community.		
5	This is a long sentence for you, I know.		
6	But I hope that you will be able to pick up where you left		
7	off when you return and that you will succeed.		
8	Is there anything, Madam Clerk, that I		
9	have omitted?		
10	THE CLERK: The pre-sentence report, do you want		
11	that marked as an exhibit?		
12	THE COURT: Yes, we will mark the pre-sentence		
13	report as exhibit S-2. Thank you for reminding me.		
14	EXHIBIT S-2: PRE-SENTENCE REPORT		
15	THE COURT: Is there anything I have overlooked,		
16	counsel?		
17	M. FANE: No, Your Honour, not on this matter.		
18	(OTHER MATTERS SPOKEN TO)		
19	THE COURT: Anything more, Mr. Moore? Anything		
20	else		
21	L. MOORE: Nothing further.		
22	THE COURT: Okay. So just to confirm, I am ordering a		
23	transcript. Initials should be used for the complainant's		
24	name. The publication ban should be noted on the		
25	cover sheet, and it should be brought to me for review.		
26	This will not be my most organized sentencing decision,		
27	but I felt it important to give it now so that we can		
	10		

1	complete this matter today.	
2	So I wish you luck, sir, and I hope that	
3	things work out all right for you.	
4		
5		
6	(PROCEEDINGS CONCLUDED)	
7		
8	CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPT	
9	Neesons, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing	
10	pages are a complete and accurate transcript of the	
11	proceedings transcribed from the audio recording to the best	
12	of our skill and ability. Judicial amendments have been	
13	applied to this transcript.	
14		
15		
16	Dated at the City of Toronto, in the Province of Ontario, this	
17	2 <sup>nd</sup> day of April, 2020.	
18		
19		
20	Vin Reen	
21	Kim Neeson	
22	Principal	
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
	11	

## IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

#### BETWEEN:

#### HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

- and -

#### PETER BERTRAND

# AGREED STATEMENT OF FACTS

The following facts are admitted by the parties for the purposes of sentencing:

1.	On January 31, 2018, at the Hamlet of Fort Liard, Peter Bertrand, the accused, was drinking
	alcohol at his residence with Brian Ekotla, Shaunna Didzena, and

- 2. Mr. Bertrand invited Ms. Didzena, Mr. Ekotla and his residence as they had a flat tire. At one point during the evening, Ms. Didzena and Mr. Ekotla left Mr. Bertrand's residence.
- 3. Mr. Bertrand had vaginal sexual intercourse with prior to January 31, 2018.
- 4. Mr. Bertrand gave a statement to Cpl Nicolas Brodeur on January 31, 2018 in which he said that at the time of the assault he believed was 'too young' for him and that he believed she was 17 or 18 years old.

- 5. At the time of the sexual assault, was 15 years old and Mr. Bertrand was 59 years old.
- 6. Mr. Bertrand did not take all reasonable steps to ascertain the assault.

Dated at Yellowknife, Northwest Territories, January 20, 2020

Morgan Fage

Counsel for the Director of

Public Prosecutions

Leslie Moore

Defence Counsel

Peter Bertrand Accused



# **EXHIBIT TAG**

NUMBER NOMBRE

MACHINET CALIFFERS				
CASE NAME DOSSIER CONTRACTOR OF CASE NAME OF				
COURT COUR	CASE NUMBER DOSSIER NO.			
Suprime	S. 1 (R201800) 143			
EXHIBIT NUMER -NUMÉRO DE LA PIECE				
□MARKED #	SI = ENTERED			
Submitted by Crown/Plaintiff Defence/Respondent Couronne/Plaignant Défense/Répondant				
CLERK ACKNOWLEDGEMENT PARAPHE DU GREFFIE	Manch 9 7575			