IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

IN THE MATTER OF:

HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

JONATHAN TETSO

Transcript of the Reasons for Sentence delivered by The Honourable Justice L.A. Charbonneau, sitting in Deline, in the Northwest Territories, on the 5th day of July, 2018.

APPEARANCES:

Ms. A. Piché: Counsel for the Crown

Ms. M. Zimmer: Counsel for the Crown

Mr. C. Davison: Counsel for the Accused

(Charges under s.236(b) of the Criminal Code)

1	THE	COURT: Jonathan Tetso has pled
2		guilty to a charge of manslaughter arising from
3		the death of his mother, Irene Tetso, on
4		December 23rd, 2016. Yesterday, I heard about
5		the circumstances that led to Ms. Tetso's death.
6		I heard about the impact that these tragic events
7		had on this family and on other people in this
8		community. Now, what I have to do is impose a
9		sentence on him for that offence.
10		I know that he has already
11		received a very harsh punishment. I know that he
12		has to live the rest of his life with what he has
13		done. From everything that I have heard and read
14		since we arrived here yesterday, I know that he
15		knows how much pain he has caused his family and
16		his community, and it is very obvious to me that
17		he is in enormous pain himself.
18		To the extent that sentencing,
19		in part, is to hold people accountable for their
20		actions, I am very aware that no sentence that I
21		impose will punish Mr. Tetso more than he is
22		already being punished living every day of his
23		life knowing what he has done, especially since
24		he does not remember doing it.
25		Sentencing is part of holding

26

27

him accountable, and it must take into account

the seriousness of what he did. That seriousness

goes without saying because a life was lost. A
valuable loved member of this community was lost.

That does not mean that there cannot be
forgiveness, and many people spoke about
forgiveness yesterday. But it does not remove
the need for the Court to do its duty and impose
sentence.

The objectives of that sentence include denouncing what happened, discourage others from behaving in this way. This includes, in many ways, discouraging the behaviour that leads to these tragedies, the substance abuse that leads to these tragic consequences. This was a particularly awful and terrible event, but I can tell you that as extreme as it is, it is just one example of the many terrible, awful things what happen as a result of substance abuse in many communities of the Northwest Territories.

The lawyers have filed sentencing decisions on other manslaughter cases to help me decide what to do in this case.

Alcohol was part of every single one of those cases. Several of them were cases where an intoxicated person killed someone they loved. A spouse, a friend, a nephew, a brother even. For each of these cases, there were families broken

with sadness over what happened, and much, much said in each of these hearings about the harm that alcohol and abuse of other substances does.

I was the judge on some of those cases. I remember pain on the faces of family members and community members who were there at those sentencing hearings. The same pain I have seen today that I saw yesterday.

Today, I ask myself the same question that I ask myself every time: Could this be a turning point? Hopefully, it will be a turning point for Mr. Tetso. I have a lot of hope that it will be.

But could it be a turning point for others? Others who are also hurting and turning to alcohol to numb that pain. Could it be that this awful event triggers some real change? Obviously, this is a very strong, united community. I see that today. Could it be that this is where things start to change for others? And this is what I hope.

It comes through very clearly in the presentence report that I read, and some of the things that I heard yesterday, that many people in this community know the harm that the use of alcohol causes and that addressing that is the first step. Then, addressing all the pain and anger that people live with and is sometimes

1 the reason they drink is the next step.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

2.7

There is much healing that needs to happen, and it will not happen with alcohol or drugs. Alcohol or drugs may numb some of the pain for a short time, but it almost always leads to more pain and more problems. Ι make those comments humbly knowing that there is a lot that I do not know about this community and about this family, and I know that the solutions will not come from outsiders such as myself. just hope that this family and this community can stand together, as you are all here today, and work together to find a path, a way to help people to heal from those awful things that have happened in the past. So that other families do not have to go through what this family has to go through now.

Sentencing is never an easy decision because it requires balancing a lot of different things. In deciding on sentencing, the judge has to take into account what the person did, the circumstances of that person, and some legal principles. As far as the circumstances of what happened, those were read into the record yesterday, and I know those are painful things to have to hear about, so I am not going to repeat all the details that were read into court

1 yesterday.

Mr. Tetso does not remember these events, and there was no witness to what happened between him and his mother. So much remains unknown. What we know, and I have to refer to some of these details to put the rest of what I say in context, what we know is that Mr. Tetso got intoxicated that day. He drank in the afternoon, and he drank again after work. He got into an argument with his friend Connie and with his nephew Christian. They ended up at Irene Tetso's house. There was more arguing there, and she asked them to leave.

Mr. Tetso was hitting furniture, and at one point, he pushed Connie, and she left. Christian then arrived at Irene Tetso's house. He was coming to check on her. He got into an argument with Mr. Tetso, and Mr. Tetso actually attacked him. Christian thinks he was hit with a frying pan, but whatever it was, after being hit, he was bleeding from the head. So when he returned home, his mother took him to the health centre.

No one knows what happened next between Mr. Tetso and his mother. But during the evening, there was some sort of an altercation. And by 11 p.m., when Christian went

back to the house to check on her, she was dead. The house was in chaos. One of the strange aspects of this case that remains unexplained was that there was red paint spilled everywhere in the house, and there was paint both on Mr. Tetso and on his mother. Without going into more detail, it was obvious from the state of the house, and things that were observed, that there had been a fight of some duration there. Some of the injuries found on

Some of the injuries found on Ms. Tetso, although none of them were found to be the cause of death, were caused by a sharp object. Knives were found in the house, and there was also blood found on various locations.

The conclusions of the doctors who examined Ms. Tetso's body was that her death was caused by a combination of things, which included the fact that she was sick. She suffered from chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, which is a serious respiratory disease. Another factor was that she, herself, had consumed a lot of alcohol that night. A third factor were the injuries that were inflicted by her son.

Doctors could not quantify in which proportion each of these causes contributed to her death, but they did conclude that the

injuries inflicted by Mr. Tetso were a
significant contributing cause. In simple terms
what that means is that her death was
sufficiently connected to Mr. Tetso's actions to
make him guilty under the criminal law of having
caused her death unlawfully.

Turning to Mr. Tetso's circumstances, they do have to be taken into account, and in this case, I have the benefit of the very detailed presentence report that gives me a lot of information about Mr. Tetso, although, I, of course, have never met him. That report has been very helpful to me. I thank its author.

I do want to say that it also has been extremely helpful for me to read and hear the letters of support and the victim impact statements that were prepared, as well as to listen to what Mr. Modeste had to say when he spoke yesterday. I am very grateful to those who had the courage to share their knowledge and experiences of Mr. Tetso with me at this difficult time, and I am grateful to Marlene Kenny for having allowed me to see some of the family photos that she shared.

Judges know when they sentence a person for a crime that there is a lot more to

the person than the crime they committed. We know that we often hear about a snapshot, we hear about one part, sometimes a few parts of the person's life. Everything I have read and heard has really helped me fill out the rest of the picture, and all of the other things that

Mr. Tetso is about. His helpfulness to others, his kindness, how much respect people have for him in this community. There are a lot of difficult things about his background, but also many, many reasons to have hope for the future.

One of the themes that comes out from what I heard and read is that there are people in this community who want to help him when he gets out of custody and returns to the community. There are people who have invited him, not just once he is released, but well ahead of his release date to be in touch, so that they can help prepare for his return, so that he can be successful when he returns. And that is very important.

One of the objectives of sentencing is to protect the community. Protect every one of you from harm that could be caused by others. Ultimately, the best way to protect the community from Mr. Tetso is for him to have supports when he returns, and when he has to make

those difficult decisions, the choice not to drink or not to do any of the other things that have led him to destructive behaviour. I really hope that Mr. Tetso will take up the community on that invitation. He will need his community when he is released.

He has a lot of support, and I can say that not every person I have sentenced had that kind of support. In fact, I think this may be one of the cases I have heard where I sense there is the most support. Mr. Tetso has had a lot of misfortune in his life, but the support and love of his family and his community is the greatest of treasures.

everything that is in the presentence report, but I do want to say I have carefully considered Mr. Tetso's background, and I find it to be a very significant consideration on sentencing. He is a very good example of what is sometimes called "intergenerational trauma." Both his parents attended residential school. Through the information in the presentence report, we know, and we know, in any event, that, for many, this was not a positive experience. Those kinds of experiences affect people, and their ability to parent their children.

abused alcohol in the home, and as a child, he was exposed to the chaos and dysfunction that comes with that. He was put in foster care when he was 13 because of the situation in his home. He, himself, started abusing alcohol when he was a teenager. Things got worse for him after the death of his father. His alcohol abuse got worse, and this led to other problems. I heard that he struggled with suicidal ideas over time, and attempted suicide on a number of occasions. It seems that he spent many years of his life in a terrible spiral.

enough, but he also was a witness to a double murder and suicide within a year or so after the death of his father. He knew all three people who died. What that would do to someone is unimaginable. I could try to imagine it, but I cannot know. So it is not difficult to understand why Mr. Tetso has some grief and anger inside of him, and perhaps it comes out when he is intoxicated.

One of the psychologists who saw Mr. Tetso in 2006 commented that Mr. Tetso "would like to stop drinking, but finds life too painful to experience soberly." His lawyer

mentioned this in submissions yesterday, and it struck me, too, when I read it the first time.

It is such a heartbreaking statement, but I have no doubt it accurately reflects how he has felt at times. Probably a lot of the time, and, again, based on what he's been through, it is not difficult at all to understand that that is how he would feel about experiencing life. The problem, of course, is that alcohol may mask the pain temporarily, but it often causes more pain, and it allows the anger and the pain to build up and blow up with results that can be catastrophic, as they were in this case.

What is very important to remember also, though, is that Mr. Tetso actually has a lot going for him. He has been able to work. He is a talented artist. By all accounts, he is deeply, deeply connected with his culture and with his traditional ways. He has a daughter that he has to think about, and as I have already mentioned, he has enormous support from his family. Many spoke of forgiveness and love. These are all things that can be solid anchors. He has a lot of good things to fall back on, but I think he understands that that can only happen if he remains sober. It is true for him as it is

true for so many who struggle with the same kinds of issues.

I do understand why people say "this is a nice person when he is sober." "It was the alcohol who did this." Many people said things along those lines to the author of the presentence report, and yesterday in the letters and the victim impact statements that I read.

I think it also has to be recognized that there is more to it than the alcohol, and I say this with enormous respect for those who talked about alcohol being the reason for all of this.

Some people consume alcohol, even to excess, and are not violent when they are intoxicated. Without doubt, the alcohol may be what causes the violence and the anger to explode out of someone, but the alcohol is never the actual reason for the anger. It is often said that achieving sobriety can be very hard, but even as hard as it is, it is only the first step. The even harder work starts once the alcohol is no longer used to mask the pain, the issues, and the terrible memories.

On the whole, the evidence about Mr. Tetso's circumstances reduce his moral blameworthiness. His experience is exactly what

the Supreme Court of Canada talked about and said should be taken into account in sentencing

Aboriginal offenders. It would be very difficult to find a more compelling example of such a situation.

I said I have to take into account the principles of sentencing, and I do not intend to go on and on this afternoon about what those principles are. I have considered them carefully, and I have considered the cases that were filed.

I will say that the crime of manslaughter is causing the death of another person through an unlawful act. It is always very serious because always someone has died. It is fundamentally different from murder because it does not involve an intent to cause death. It's an offence that can be committed in a very wide range of ways from something arising from a near accident all the way to the thing that is very close to actual murder.

Because the range of conduct is so broad, the sentencing range is also very broad. The *Criminal Code* says that for manslaughter, the sentence can be anything from no jail to life in jail. And in the Northwest Territories, we have examples of both those

1 I know at least one case where someone extremes. did not get jail on a manslaughter conviction, and I know of one case where someone got life imprisonment on a manslaughter conviction.

> More often than not, cases are not at those two extremes. But usually, a significant jail term is required to reflect the seriousness of causing the death of another no matter how sympathic the circumstances of the offender may be. And this is reflected in the cases filed by counsel. Sentences between four and six years were imposed in these cases. always difficult to compare cases, though, because there are so many different features to every one.

> To decide what a fit sentence is in this case, I must be guided by what is called "proportionality." A sentence must be proportionate to the seriousness of the offence and the degree of the blameworthiness of the person who committed it. I have already talked about things that reduce Mr. Tetso's blameworthiness, but there are also things about his defence that elevate his blameworthiness what we call "aggravating factors."

Even with the lack of clarity as to exactly what happened, we know that this

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

fight went on for some time. The injuries show that a weapon was used at some point. Ms. Tetso was in her own home where she should have been safe. She was harmed by a trusted family member, someone she should have been able to expect protection from. Indeed, I heard that a lot of times, Mr. Tetso did look after her and protected her. But not this night.

She was particularly vulnerable given the level of intoxication, her small stature, and her health issues. This was also the culmination of an afternoon and evening where Mr. Tetso was aggressive and violent towards others as well. He was not charged separately for this, but he did attack another family member and caused injuries that required medical attention.

These are things that make the situation more serious, but there are also mitigating factors.

The guilty plea is an extremely mitigating factor for many reasons. First of all, it has spared his family members the anxiety of knowing they would have to testify, and the trauma of testifying and having to relive these events. I have presided over many trials, and I see what going through the

trial process can do to people who have to testify. Especially in this case, I can only imagine how truly awful it would have been for Mr. Tetso's family members to have to testify as prosecution witnesses.

The second reason the guilty plea is extremely mitigating is that in circumstances where Mr. Tetso does not remember what he did, the fact that he is prepared to take responsibility for it adds to the mitigating effect of that plea. It is a very compelling demonstration of his true, genuine remorse. Especially since he did so against the advice of his lawyer.

Somewhat related to this is that there would have been significant triable issues in this case. What I mean by that is that the issue of causation, what actually caused Ms. Tetso's death, would not have been clear-cut. Far from it. It may have been challenging for the Crown to prove causation beyond a reasonable doubt under all had these circumstances. To put it bluntly, had Mr. Tetso exercised his right to have a trial, his counsel might well have been able to raise a doubt about causation, and Mr. Tetso may have avoided being convicted for this offence.

But instead, he chose to take responsibility and give up his right to put the Crown to the proof of its case. That is a remarkable demonstration of true remorse, and it says an awful lot about his character. It fits very well, actually, with how many have described Mr. Tetso. Someone who cares deeply about his family, wants to help others, and someone who has good values.

Having thought about this, I actually have to say I find it difficult to think of a situation where a guilty plea could be more mitigating than in this case.

I agree with the Crown that the criminal record is not much a factor on the sentencing. It shows that Mr. Tetso has been in trouble before, he has committed assaults before, but when I look at the sentences that were imposed for those offences, they must have been at the very minor end of the scale. I am also aware that he was on probation for mischief when he committed this offence. Again, it is a factor, but it is not of great significance.

On this case, the Crown and Defence have presented a joint submission. They are both saying that I should impose a sentence of four and a half years for Mr. Tetso. They

also agree that Mr. Tetso is entitled to credit
for the time he has already spent in custody, and
that whatever sentence I impose needs to be
reduced to reflect that.

The law is that when the lawyers present a joint submission, a judge has to give that joint submission a lot of weight. A judge cannot not follow a joint submission unless a judge thinks the joint submission is completely unreasonable that it is so removed from what the judge thinks the sentence should be that it could cause the public to lose confidence in the criminal justice system.

The reason the law says that judges have to put so much weight on a joint submission is that the lawyers know the case inside out. They know about all of the evidence, the issues that could have arisen. They know things about the case that may actually not come out in court, things that I will never know, so their assessment of what the sentence should be, things like the value of the guilty plea, for example, is deserving of a lot of consideration.

The other reason is that people who agree to plead guilty knowing that a joint position will be presented may be less willing to plead guilty if they do not have

confidence that the joint recommendation will generally be followed. And for the reasons I have already talked about, there is enormous value in avoiding trials. All this to say, even if I disagreed with the joint submission, it would not be the reason not to follow it. I would have to think it is entirely unreasonable before I could do something else.

Those who were here yesterday know that I raised this issue, and it is not because I disagree with the joint submission, actually I think, as counsel have recognized, that given the aggravating factors and the circumstances of the assault on Ms. Tetso, it is more on the lenient side of the range. But I agree that given the mitigating factors and Mr. Tetso's circumstances, this is the case where the maximum restraint possible should be exercised.

The joint position recognizes that Mr. Tetso has spared witnesses in this community additional harm and trauma of this matter going to trial. That would have prolonged the uncertainty and the anxiety. It may have caused divisions within the community or within the family. It might have caused further harm. Giving up one's right to a trial is giving up a

lot. It has saved court time and resources, but that is not the most important part. The most important part is that it has spared many people from going through the difficult process of a trial. I commend the Crown for exercising as much restraint as it did in taking that position.

The joint position also demonstrates realism and fairness of the Defence's part. It shows the willingness to acknowledge the seriousness of this matter despite all the positive things and the factors that reduce Mr. Tetso's blameworthiness, and specifically, his circumstances as an Aboriginal offender.

In the end, of course, it is my responsibility to decide what the sentence should be. My only hesitation about following the joint submission is that it means that a further jail term of more than two years has to be imposed if I follow it. And that places the sentence by just a few months in the penitentiary range. What that means is that it would be up to the correctional authorities to decide whether Mr. Tetso will serve his jail term in the north. And I listened to many people yesterday who asked that I impose a sentence that would not result in him being sent to a penitentiary.

1 One person asked me to 2 sentence him to "time served." This is not 3 something that I can do. 4 I have to follow the law. The 5 lawyers who are here on this case are experienced, thorough, extremely competent, and 6 7 extremely fair, and I do not doubt that they have given their positions careful consideration. 8 as I have said, I have to agree that they are 9 10 right. 11 I have a lot of compassion for 12 Mr. Tetso and for his family, but I must also 13 ensure that my decision is in line with the law 14 and does reflect the seriousness of what 15 happened. What is being proposed is a fit 16 sentence in all circumstances. It represents an extremely restrained approach for this type of 17 18 offence. But I think it is the fair and just 19 result. 20 I have to trust and hope that 21 the authorities responsible for making placement 22 decisions will recognize that 1) a further jail 23 term imposed will be barely above the two-year 24 2) that Mr. Tetso has considerable support 25 from his community, and that fostering that continued support is an important aspect of his 26

27

rehabilitation, which, ultimately, is what we all

want to see happen. 3) that he has already taken steps towards rehabilitation within the northern institution where he was on remand, including regular contact with professionals in that institution. He has made progress, and that should be encouraged.

I really, really hope that based on all of this, and based on all of the evidence heard at this hearing, the information included in the presentence report, and everything else that was filed, it will be as obvious to those making placement decisions, as it is to me, that Mr. Tetso should be permitted to serve his sentence in the north.

orders, and I will deal with those first. This is a primary designated offence, so there will be a DNA order. There will also be a firearms prohibition as of today and ten years after Mr. Tetso's release. There will be an order for a victim of crime surcharge as it is mandatory. The time to pay a default time as provided by the statute.

Can you stand up, please.

Mr. Tetso, I am going to follow the joint submission. If it was not for the time you already spent in custody, the sentence would have

been four and a half years. For the 560 days you have already spent in custody, I give you credit for 27 and a half months. So the further jail term will be 26 and a half months, which means two years and two and a half months. You can sit down.

I direct that a transcript of what I said this afternoon be prepared on an expedited basis so that it can be sent to the correctional authorities for their review and considered when they make their placement decision.

reasons, that a copy of the presentence report, the victim impact statements, and all the support letters be sent to the correctional authorities as well so they can see for themselves the kind of support that you have, and so they can see for themselves why it is important. I also hope that that information will be of assistance to those who are working with you while you serve your sentence.

Mr. Tetso, I know you are truly sorry about this. I know you are being punished every day for having to live with what you have done, and that my sentence means very little compared to what you are already going

1	through. I have also not often heard and read as
2	many words of support and love for a person that
3	I have to sentence.

You are well regarded by members of this community and by your family. As your sister told you yesterday, do not forget that. There are people here, as I mentioned, that would like you to be in touch with them ahead of your release so they can help prepare for your return, so they can put things in place to help you succeed. Everyone wants to see you succeed, and you will need these supports.

You have many, many talents.

Many ways to contribute to this community. You can share your experience with others when you are ready. You can help others who are struggling in the way you have struggled. You can be there for your daughter and help her to become a strong, wise woman. You are still young, and there is a lot for you to do. So many goods things you can do for Deline. Do not give up hope, and do not give up on life.

Have I missed anything from the Defence's perspective?

MR. DAVISON:

No. But in addition to the

MR. DAVISON:

No. But in addition to the

other steps that you have directed be taken, I

would ask there be an endorsement on the warrant

1	of committal that the Court is giving as strong
2	as possible recommendation to placement in the
3	north, and perhaps even to alert the authorities
4	that that document that the transcript and other
5	materials that you referred to will be sent to
6	them as quickly as possible so they don't
7	possibly make a decision before having that
8	material.
9	THE COURT: Yes. Thank you for reminding
10	me. That is very much my intention. I am
11	directing that the warrant of committal be
12	endorsed with my strongest, and I do want the
13	word "strongest" to be there in bold and
14	underlined, recommendation that Mr. Tetso will be
15	permitted to serve his sentence in a northern
16	institution. And I am going to direct that a
17	note be sent along with the warrant of committal
18	indicating that I have ordered that a copy of the
19	transcript and all of the exhibits be sent to the
20	correctional authorities as well.
21	I do not see a reason why
22	copies of the exhibits cannot be sent right away
23	when we return to Yellowknife, but also let them
24	know that the transcript will be coming.
25	Have I overlooked anything
26	else?
27	MS. PICHÉ: No, Your Honour.

1	THE	COURT:	Thank you.
2			Before we close court, I want
3		to thank the court	staff. I want to thank the
4		interpreter for her	hard work. I thank and
5		commend all counsel	for their work on this case,
6		and I thank the com	munity members for their
7		participation and f	for attending today and for
8		showing as much sup	pport as you have for
9		Mr. Tetso. Because	e, ultimately, I believe
10		strongly that that	is what will make the
11		difference for the	future.
12			We will close court.
13	THE	COURT CLERK:	Thank you, Your Honour.
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			

1	
2	CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPT
3	
4	I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the
5	foregoing pages are a complete and accurate
6	transcript of the proceedings produced from the
7	stenographic notes of Karilee Mankow, Court Reporter,
8	in shorthand and transcribed from audio recording
9	to the best of my skill and ability.
10	Dated at the City of Edmonton, Province of
11	Alberta, this 31st day of July, 2018.
12	
13	Certified Pursuant to Rule 723
14	of the Rules of Court
15	
16	
17	Laisteelankaro
18	
19	Karilee Mankow
20	Court Reporter
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	