IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

IN THE MATTER OF:

HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

- and -

EDWARD CHRISTOPHER SNOWSHOE

Transcript of the Oral Reasons for Sentence delivered by the Honourable Justice V.A. Schuler, sitting at Yellowknife, in the Northwest Territories, on June 20th, A.D. 2007.

APPEARANCES:

Ms. D. Keats: Counsel for the Crown

Mr. J. Brydon: Counsel for the Accused

(Charge under s. 344(a) Criminal Code)

- 1 THE COURT: Good morning.
- 2 MS. KEATS: Good morning, Your Honour.
- 3 THE COURT: Mr. Brydon, you are appearing
- for Mr. Hansen?
- 5 MR. BRYDON: Yes, I am. Thank you, Your
- 6 Honour.
- 7 THE COURT: All right. I will now give my
- 8 reasons and the sentence in Mr. Snowshoe's case.
- 9 Mr. Snowshoe has pleaded guilty to a charge of
- 10 use of a firearm in the commission of a robbery
- 11 contrary to section 344(a) of the Criminal Code.
- 12 Perhaps, Ms. Keats, I don't think we dealt
- 13 with this yesterday, but did you want to deal
- with count 2 in the indictment?
- 15 MS. KEATS: Certainly, Your Honour. The
- 16 Crown requests a stay of proceedings be entered
- on the second count.
- 18 THE COURT: All right. The Crown will be
- 19 entering a stay --
- 20 MS. KEATS: Yes.
- 21 THE COURT: -- then, on that count? All
- 22 right. That's fine. Thank you.
- The facts are set out at some length in the
- 24 Agreed Statement of Facts, which is Exhibit S-1,
- so I will summarize them somewhat briefly for
- 26 purposes of this decision.
- 27 On March 1st of this year, Mr. Snowshoe

arranged to be picked up by a taxi in Inuvik and asked the driver, Mr. El Khatib, to take him to the airport. On the way, Mr. Snowshoe pulled out a .22 calibre rifle that he had concealed in his coat and pointed it at Mr. El Khatib from the back seat. He told Mr. El Khatib that he wanted his car. Mr. El Khatib told him that he could have the car, but Mr. Snowshoe ordered him to keep driving and to turn off the highway and then to stop in an out of the way place approximately five or six kilometres out of town.

At one point after the vehicle stopped Mr. Snowshoe fired a bullet from the back seat into the dashboard of the car. He subsequently ordered Mr. El Khatib to get out of the vehicle and lie on his stomach and told him that he would tie him up and put him in the trunk.

Mr. El Khatib got out of the vehicle and managed to run away. Mr. Snowshoe, who had been pointing the gun at him all through this, fired off a round through the back window and, although apparently not aiming at the victim, did hit Mr. El Khatib in the side between his ribs and hip.

Mr. El Khatib flagged down a passing vehicle, called the police on his cell phone and was taken by the driver to the hospital. The encounter with the taxi driver took about 15

1 minutes.

Mr. Snowshoe then took \$45 from the cab and drove the cab back towards the Town of Inuvik where the police saw him. He tried to evade them, but lost control of the vehicle and struck a snowbank. He exited the vehicle and surrendered to the police and was cooperative with them from that point on, confessing to what he had done and re-enacting the crime. He told the police that he had planned to rob the taxi driver and take his car and tie him up and put him in the trunk.

Mr. El Khatib was able to walk into the hospital. An attempt to remove the bullet was unsuccessful, and the surgeon decided it would be best to leave it in him. He was released from hospital the next day, March 2nd. There is no evidence before me as to his condition since then.

Mr. Snowshoe was not intoxicated or high at the time of the offence. He had, according to what he later told the police, hitchhiked to Inuvik from Fort McPherson the night before the robbery armed with the gun which he had stolen some time ago. He told the police that he planned that morning what he would do with the taxi driver. He also said to them, when first

taken into custody, words to the effect that he
was prepared to get caught, that it was either
that or kill himself, that his life was going
nowhere.

It is clear from the facts that Mr. Snowshoe embarked on his plan well-armed with the gun, which was a .22 pump action sawed-off rifle that he had loaded 11 bullets into that morning. He also had two knives, a flashlight, rope to tie up the taxi driver and latex gloves to cover his fingerprints. He had also taped the rifle and one of the knives, apparently to avoid fingerprints. He had covered most of his face with a neck warmer.

that he could have the car,

Mr. Snowshoe acted in an intimidating and violent
manner in the vehicle using the barrel of the gun
to move the rearview mirror so that Mr. El Khatib
could not look at him, swearing and yelling at
Mr. El Khatib, telling him to lie on the ground,
telling him that he was going to tie him up and
put him in the trunk, and firing the bullet into
the dashboard; all of this while Mr. El Khatib
was pleading with him to just take the car.

Mr. Snowshoe is 21 years old. He is an Aboriginal man from Fort McPherson. He was

raised by his single mother, who has an alcohol problem, and he, as the eldest child, has tried to play a parental role to his younger siblings.

He has a grade 10 education and what counsel described as a spotty work history.

2.6

He has a fairly brief criminal record consisting of two theft convictions as a youth, and in 2004 as an adult two break and enter convictions and two charges of failing to comply with a youth disposition. He was sentenced to a total of five months in jail for those offences, which, since they were his first offences as an adult, may suggest that the circumstances of them were quite serious, although I have no definite information before me in that regard. He has no previous record for violence.

His counsel submitted a letter from a friend of Mr. Snowshoe's mother who describes him as a well-behaved and respectful young man who has always been helpful to his mother and family.

At the time of the offence, Mr. Snowshoe had no job, was unhappy with his family situation and upset that a month earlier two of his siblings were taken into the care of Social Services, leading him to feel that he had failed the family.

It is understandable that this combination

of circumstances would lead him to feel
depressed. However, to react to that situation
by arming himself in the way that he did and
executing what was a fairly well-thought-out plan
to rob a taxi driver is, as I am sure Mr.
Snowshoe now realizes, completely unreasonable
and dangerous.

While it does appear that Mr. Snowshoe did put quite a bit of thought and planning into the offence, much of what he did does not really make sense: For example, wanting to steal the car, but, at the same time, planning to put the driver in the trunk so that the police would find him there. The fact that much of what he did does not make sense and the words that he spoke to the police about suicide does give rise to concern about what else Mr. Snowshoe might have done had the police not got there when they did.

It may be that Mr. Snowshoe, as he told the police, did not want to shoot anybody, but the facts indicate that Mr. Snowshoe was in control of himself and was quite deliberate in his actions toward the taxi driver. Shooting off a rifle inside a vehicle beside where the driver was sitting and then shooting in his direction while he was running from the vehicle are both extremely dangerous acts. I hope that Mr.

Snowshoe realizes that it is only through luck
that one of his bullets did not kill Mr. El

Khatib. It is only through luck that the final
bullet was not fatal and that Mr. Snowshoe is not
here facing a charge of murder. It is also only
luck that Mr. El Khatib was not much more
severely injured.

There is no victim impact statement, so I do not have evidence of the actual effect of these events on the taxi driver. Obviously, however, the circumstances must have been terrifying for him and not something he is likely to get over very easily.

As has been pointed out in the cases dealing with assaults on taxi drivers, they are people in a particularly vulnerable position, because they provide a service to the public, to the community in circumstances that put them at risk. This factor makes denunciation of this offence and discouraging others who might commit like offences significant objectives of the sentence to be imposed on Mr. Snowshoe.

Quite apart from that, the offence of robbery with a firearm does entail a maximum sentence of life imprisonment and a minimum punishment of imprisonment for four years. So obviously it has been recognized as one of the

1 more serious offences in the Criminal Code.

Crown counsel in this case submits that a sentence in the five to seven-year range is appropriate, while defence counsel submits that four or five years less remand time is sufficient.

The cases that were submitted - and I have reviewed them all - do indicate that robbery of any kind where a firearm is involved and also robbery of a taxi driver will be treated severely. I would simply note, again, the comment that I made in the McInnes case, quoting the Cullen case from Prince Edward Island, that the four-year minimum for use of a firearm in the commission of an offence such as robbery should be considered in light of the fact that it would apply even to a youthful accused without any criminal record in circumstances where no bodily injury was caused.

At the same time, I take note of what was said in the Young case from Ontario - and I think this is applicable in the Northwest Territories, as well - that the length of a first penitentiary sentence for a youthful offender should rarely be determined solely by the objectives of denunciation and deterrence and that the Court should sentence the accused to the shortest

possible sentence which will achieve the relevant objectives.

The aggravating factors in this case are that the offence was planned. Mr. Snowshoe armed himself and decided to embark on a robbery of a taxi driver. Even if he did not plan to shoot anyone, he at least planned to use force of some kind. He had rope with him to tie up the taxi driver. He certainly planned to show force by means of the gun and perhaps the knives that he had with him. He continued to intimidate and threaten the taxi driver even after he was offered the car. It is aggravating that he used the gun not once, but twice. He took steps before the robbery to conceal his identity and afterwards attempted to evade police.

It is also aggravating that at the time of this event he was on release after being charged with other offences. It is aggravating that he used the gun in such a way that harm was likely to come to the taxi driver, and that he did, in fact, cause injury to him.

The mitigating factors are, first, the fact that Mr. Snowshoe did surrender to the police after the vehicle ended up in the snowbank; that he offered no resistance at all from that point and was fully cooperative.

2.6

The guilty plea, which I would characterize
as a guilty plea at the earliest reasonable
opportunity, is very significant, because it
indicates that Mr. Snowshoe takes responsibility
for what he did, and it means that the victim has
not had to testify at all and relive these
events.

I also take into account the words spoken by Mr. Snowshoe here in court indicating that he is sorry for what he did.

I will take into account the remand time since his arrest on March 1st up to the date he was sentenced on the charges that were outstanding on the date of this offence. I do note that defence counsel indicated that that remand time was not taken into account when Mr. Snowshoe was sentenced on those other charges. However, I know of no precedent for taking into account the time that Mr. Snowshoe has been sentenced to serve on those other charges. The request made by defence counsel was that that time, too, be considered remand time because Mr. Snowshoe was still on remand for this particular offence. As I say, I know of no precedent for taking that time into account and I decline to do so.

27 As I have already noted, denunciation and

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2.6

deterrence are important factors because of the nature of the offence. Although armed robbery and, I would say, robbery of a taxi driver is not particularly prevalent in this jurisdiction, there have been some very serious incidents, and the sentence that I impose in this case should deter other offenders from making this type of offence more prevalent.

Because of Mr. Snowshoe's age and his lack of any really significant record, rehabilitation is also a factor to be considered. In other words, despite the seriousness of this offence, the Court and society should not give up on Mr. Snowshoe.

Also, although Mr. Snowshoe is Aboriginal, it has not been suggested that that should be a major factor in the sentence, and, of course, I can only deal with the length of the sentence because of the four-year minimum, not the type of sentence.

Unfortunately, Mr. Snowshoe seems to have faced the problems that a number of young people face in the small communities and also the larger ones of the Northwest Territories; a difficult family life, alcohol abuse in the home, little education, lack of a job and other opportunities, and I do take that into account. At the same

time, Mr. Snowshoe's reaction to those problems
is alarming and indicates to me that he has some
very serious issues he needs to deal with.

The sentence I impose must be proportionate to the gravity of the offence and the responsibility of the offender. For the reasons already referred to, this offence is a very grave one. Although Mr. Snowshoe's personal circumstances at the time of the offence were difficult and sad, nothing in the facts before me lessens in any way his responsibility for his actions.

There are some ancillary orders that have to be dealt with. My understanding, and correct me if I am wrong, counsel, is that robbery is still a secondary designated offence under the Criminal Code. The Crown seeks a DNA order and it was not opposed by defence. I am satisfied in all the circumstances that that order should be made. So there will be an order requiring Mr. Snowshoe to provide a DNA sample. If counsel do not have an order here today, I will direct that it be submitted to me within 15 days of today's date.

A firearm prohibition order is mandatory, and there will be such an order in the usual terms. The order will commence today and continue for a period that expires 10 years after

1 Mr. Snowshoe's release from imprisonment. Any
2 firearms are to be surrendered to the RCMP
3 immediately.

into account the remand time in this case, which I will credit as four months. In my view, a sentence at the high end of what the Crown is seeking would not be unreasonable for this offence, considering the planned nature of it and the fact that the victim was shot. However, Mr. Snowshoe's age and the very early guilty plea and his cooperation with the police persuade me that I should be looking to the lower end of that range. I will say, however, that the aggravating factors are too pronounced to compel me toward the minimum of four years.

Mr. Hansen made some submissions about at what point Mr. Snowshoe would be likely to be sent to a penitentiary in the south rather than kept here. I have to say that I have heard so many different things from different counsel about that, and I do not mean that in a critical sense, but I am just not convinced that there is any firm rule in that regard.

Having taken into account the remand time, the factors that I have mentioned and, as I say, considering the range in light of those various

2.6

- factors, I sentence you today, Mr. Snowshoe, to a period of five years in jail.
- I am going to direct that the Clerk endorse
 the warrant of committal with the Court's
 recommendation that you be given the opportunity
 to upgrade your education and to take anger
 management counselling, because I think that is
 something that you do very badly need.

9 As I say, I have to suspect from the circumstances that there are a number of other 10 problems that you have that you need to deal 11 12 with. I do not know whether you can get help for those here in the Northwest Territories, and 13 because of that I am not going to have the 14 15 warrant endorsed with any recommendation as to where you will serve your time. I will leave 16 that to the correctional authorities. But I am 17 18 hoping that you will be offered some help, and I 19 hope that you will take that help and do some 20 work to make sure that you never again do 21 anything like this. You can have a seat, Mr. 22 Snowshoe.

- The victim surcharge will be waived in the circumstances.
- Is there anything else that I need to consider, counsel?
- 27 MS. KEATS: No. Thank you.

1	MR.	BRYDON:	Not that I know of, no. Thank
2		you.	
3	THE	COURT:	All right. Thank you both
4		very much. We wi	ll close court.
5			
6			
7			Certified to be a true and accurate transcript pursuant
8			to Rules 723 and 724 of the Supreme Court Rules.
9			Supreme Court Rules.
10			
11			Jill MacDonald, CSR(A), RPR
12			Court Reporter
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			