R. v. Desjarlais, 2005 NWTSC 35 S-1-CR-2005000022

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

IN THE MATTER OF:

HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

- and -

YVONNE DESJARLAIS

Transcript of the Oral Reasons for Sentence by The Honourable Justice J.E. Richard, sitting at Yellowknife, in the Northwest Territories, on March 31st, A.D. 2005.

APPEARANCES:

Ms. S. Tkatch:

Counsel for the Crown

Ms. T. Nguyen:

Counsel for the Accused

(Charges under s. 268, 267(a) Criminal Code)

THE COURT:

I am going to impose sentence now on Ms. Desjarlais, and I am going to raise my voice because of her hearing problem, and I apologize to others in the courtroom.

This offender is a 55-year-old Dene woman from Lutsel K'e who is to be sentenced for two serious crimes of violence committed by her on December 16th in her home community.

The evidence before the Court is that Yvonne Dosjarlais is an alcoholic and has been for many years. She has lived most of her life in Lutsel K'e. There is no evidence that she has caused any problems in her community or committed any crimes before December 16th, 2004.

She was intoxicated on December 16th at her brother's home and got into an argument with her brother and stabbed him with a knife. Ms.

Desjarlais was asked to leave that home and she did and she returned to her own home. There she got into an argument with her husband. She got a knife from the kitchen and approached her husband waving the knife at him. Another person intervened and took the knife from her, fortunately, before any injury could be done.

Ms. Desjarlais was arrested by the RCMP in Lutsel K'e on the evening of December 16th. On December 21st she was released on an undertaking

by a Justice of the Peace in Yellowknife, one of the conditions being that she was not to consume or possess alcohol. She was arrested again one day later because she was grossly intoxicated. She was released again on a recognizance on February 28th, 2005. Her Preliminary Inquiry was scheduled for April 21st, but she has now waived her Preliminary Inquiry and appears in this court and has pleaded guilty to the two charges.

She does not have full recollection of the December 16th events, but accepts that she did what is alleged. She does not understand why she resorted to violence, because she says that she is very close to both her brother, Alfred Abel, and her husband, Joe Desjarlais. I am going to accept defence counsel's submission that this violent behaviour was unusual or out of character behaviour for Yvonne Desjarlais. The evidence does indicate, however, that she can be a danger to her family and to her community when she is intoxicated.

It must be obvious to everyone in this courtroom, including Yvonne Desjarlais, that it is her drinking that must be addressed. It is to Ms. Desjarlais' credit that she accepts responsibility for her criminal acts at an early stage. She needs to deal with her alcoholism

with the support of her family and friends and professional counsellors. I am sure that her family and friends and the community of Lutsel K'e will be supportive, but it is she who must make the ultimate decision to stop drinking.

After consideration of all of the circumstances, including the age and antecedents of Yvonne Desjarlais, I have decided that I will today not impose a jail sentence on Ms.

Desjarlais, but will, instead, suspend the passing of sentence and place her on probation.

I will ask that her lawyer, Ms. Nguyen, explain carefully to her the implications of this disposition should she fail to adhere to the conditions of the probation order.

With respect to the two convictions under section 267(a) of the Criminal Code, I suspend the passing of sentence for a period of 12 months, and I direct that Yvonne Desjarlais be released on the following conditions prescribed in her probation order: You will keep the peace and be of good behaviour. You will appear again before this Court when required to do so. You will report within 24 hours to the offices of Probation Services here in Yellowknife and thereafter to a probation officer in Yellowknife or Lutsel K'e as directed. You will abstain from

the excessive consumption of alcohol. You will 1 take whatever counselling or treatment is 2 recommended by the probation officer to deal with 3 your alcohol addiction. You will, with the assistance of the probation officer, provide a written report to this Court at three-month intervals advising of your compliance with all terms of the probation order. Now, Ms. Desjarlais, you are going to have to remain here in the courtroom until the 10 probation order is prepared. You are going to be 11 given a copy of it. I am going to ask your 12 lawyer to carefully advise you of the provisions 13

Criminal Code to ensure that you understand this order and those provisions of the Criminal Code.

I am going to direct the Clerk of the Court to send a transcript of the Court's reasons to Probation Services.

of section 732.2 and section 733.1 of the

Finally, I grant the DNA order requested by the Crown. You can hand the order up to the Clerk and I will deal with it.

MS. TKATCH: Thank you, Your Honour. Your Honour, if I may, with respect to the order that -- abstain from excessive consumption of alcohol, would Your Honour want to put at least a breath demand provision and maybe a numerical

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

number to what may be excessive. I am concerned 1 more about a judgment call being on whether she 2 is in breach or not and what's excessive to the individual police officer or probation officer that finds her. Well, I appreciate that it is THE COURT: expressed in what you might say is grey terms, 7 but I am going to leave it both to the judgment 8 of the police and the probation officer, but also 9 the Court that has to deal with it after the 10 fact. I appreciate this woman is inflicted with 11 what really is a disease, but she has got family 12 and friends that can help her, and gross 13 intoxication will be a breach of the order. 14 is the danger, that she is going to repeat this 15 kind of violent behaviour if she drinks too much, 16 and I have put that provision in there simply as 17 a balance between absolute abstention and no 18 provision at all. 19 If there is nothing else, then we will close 20 court. Thank you. 21 22 23 24 25 26 27

´	
1	Certified to be a true and accurate transcript pursuant
2	to Rules 723 and 724 of the Supreme Court Rules.
3	Supreme Court Rules.
4	Siel Wer Wor alex
5	Till Managed CSD (A) DDD
6	Fill MacDonald, CSR(A), RPRCourt Reporter
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
1	