

PART C – Decision under Appeal

The decision under appeal is the Ministry of Social Development and Poverty Reduction (the ministry) reconsideration decision dated September 19, 2017 which found that the appellant is not eligible for disability assistance (DA) for the month of September, 2017. The ministry determined that the appellant's Canada Pension Plan (CPP) disability benefits are defined as unearned income in the Employment and Assistance for Persons with Disabilities Regulation (EAPWDR) and must be deducted from disability assistance.

PART D – Relevant Legislation

Employment and Assistance for Persons with Disabilities Regulation (EAPWDR) sections 1(1) Definitions, 9, 24, 29; Schedule A, sections 1, 4; Schedule B, sections 1, 6, 7

PART E – Summary of Facts

Information before the minister at reconsideration included:

- A letter to the appellant from Service Canada dated June 26, 2017 with a Payment Explanation Statement advising he would receive a payment of \$5,945.90.
- A copy of the appellant's Monthly Report to the ministry dated August 2, 2017 stating that he received income in the amount of \$5,945.90.
- A copy of a Social Security Tribunal Decision dated May 24, 2017.
- The appellant's Request for Reconsideration signed September 12, 2017.

The Appellant submitted a statement "My reasons for appeal" with his Notice of Appeal to the Tribunal which outlined his argument and requested an exemption to the ministry's decision.

At the hearing, the appellant submitted a copy of a notice of rent increase for his apartment, increasing the monthly rent by \$30.00 to \$858.00 per month. The ministry had no objection to the admission of this document. The notice was admitted by the Panel under section 22(4) of the Employment and Assistance Act as it is in support of information that was before the minister when the decision was made.

The appellant stated that he understands the ministry policy and argued that it should be a guideline. He stated that he is unable to support himself through employment and has found that his disability assistance is not enough to live on. The appellant stated that he had assumed that his CPP disability payments would be added to his disability assistance in lieu of an income. He stated that if he were able to be employed, he would be entitled to an earnings exemption, and he does not see the CPP payments as different as they are derived from employment.

The ministry responded that the EAPWDR section 1 defines any type or class of CPP benefits as unearned income, and as such it must be deducted from disability assistance in accordance with section 24, EAPWDR. The ministry stated that there is no exemption from income for CPP benefits. As a result, the appellant's CPP benefits are to be deducted from his monthly disability assistance. In response to a question, the ministry stated that the exemption for unearned income listed in EAPWDR Schedule B, section 7(1)(e) is to the best of their knowledge applied when the CPP deduction is considered.

PART F – Reasons for Panel Decision

The issue in this appeal is the reasonableness of the ministry's decision which found that the appellant is not eligible for disability assistance (DA) for the month of September, 2017. The ministry determined that the appellant's Canada Pension Plan (CPP) disability benefits are defined as unearned income in the Employment and Assistance for Persons with Disabilities Regulation (EAPWDR) and must be deducted from disability assistance.

Legislation

EAPWDR

Definitions

1 (1) In this regulation:

"unearned income" means any income that is not earned income, and includes, without limitation, money or value received from any of the following:

(f) any type or class of Canada Pension Plan benefits

Limits on income

9 (1) For the purposes of the Act and this regulation, **"income"**, in relation to a family unit, includes an amount garnished, attached, seized, deducted or set off from the income of an applicant, a recipient or a dependant.

(2) A family unit is not eligible for disability assistance if the net income of the family unit determined under Schedule B equals or exceeds the amount of disability assistance determined under Schedule A for a family unit matching that family unit.

Amount of disability assistance

24 Subject to section 24.1 (3), disability assistance may be provided to or for a family unit, for a calendar month, in an amount that is not more than

(a) the amount determined under Schedule A, minus

(b) the family unit's net income determined under Schedule B.

Schedule A

Maximum amount of disability assistance before deduction of net income

1 (1) Subject to this section and sections 3 and 6 to 9 of this Schedule, the amount of disability assistance referred to in section 24 (a) [*amount of disability assistance*] of this regulation is the sum of

(a) the monthly support allowance under section 2 of this Schedule for a family unit matching the family unit of the applicant or recipient, plus

(b) the shelter allowance calculated under sections 4 and 5 of this Schedule.

Monthly support allowance

2(1) A monthly support allowance for the purpose of section 1 (a) is the sum of

(a) the amount set out in Column 3 of the following table for a family unit described in Column 1 of an applicant or a recipient described in Column 2, plus

(a.1) subject to section 24.1 [*disability assistance in the form of transportation support allowance*], the amount set out in Column 4 of the following table for the family unit, plus

(b) the amount calculated in accordance with subsections (2) to (4) for each dependent child in the family unit.

Item	Column 1 Family unit composition	Column 2 Age or status of applicant or recipient	Column 3 Amount of base support (\$)	Column 4 Amount of transportation support (\$)
1	Sole applicant / recipient and no dependent children	Applicant / recipient is a person with disabilities	606.42	52.00

Monthly shelter allowance

4 (2) The monthly shelter allowance for a family unit to which section 14.2 of the Act does not apply is the smaller of

(a) the family unit's actual shelter costs, and

(b) the maximum set out in the following table for the applicable family size:

Item	Column 1 Family Unit Size	Column 2 Maximum Monthly Shelter
1	1 person	\$375

Schedule B

Net Income Calculation

(section 24 (b))

Deduction and exemption rules

1 When calculating the net income of a family unit for the purposes of section 24 (b) [*amount of disability assistance*] of this regulation,

(a) the following are exempt from income:

(i) any income earned by a dependent child attending school on a full-time basis;

(ii) Repealed. [B.C. Reg. 96/2017, App. 2, s. 2 (a).]

(iii) Repealed. [B.C. Reg. 48/2010, Sch. 1, s. 2 (c).]

(iv) a family bonus, except the portion treated as unearned income under section 10 (1) of this Schedule;

(iv.1) the Canada child benefit, except the portion treated as unearned income under section 10 (1) of this Schedule;

- (v) the basic child tax benefit;
- (vi) a goods and services tax credit under the *Income Tax Act* (Canada);
- (vii) a tax credit under section 8 [*refundable sales tax credit*], 8.1 [*low income climate action tax credit*] or 8.2 [*BC harmonized sales tax credit*] of the *Income Tax Act* (British Columbia);
- (viii) individual redress payments granted by the government of Canada to a person of Japanese ancestry;
- (ix) individual payments granted by the government of Canada under the Extraordinary Assistance Plan to a person infected by the human immunodeficiency virus;
- (x) individual payments granted by the government of British Columbia to a person infected by the human immunodeficiency virus or to the surviving spouse or dependent children of that person;
- (xi) individual payments granted by the government of Canada under the Extraordinary Assistance Plan to thalidomide victims;
- (xii) money that is
 - (A) paid or payable to a person if the money is awarded to the person by an adjudicative panel in respect of claims of abuse at Jericho Hill School for the Deaf and drawn from a lump sum settlement paid by the government of British Columbia, or
 - (B) paid or payable to or for a person if the payment is in accordance with the settlement agreement approved by the Supreme Court in Action No. C980463, Vancouver Registry;
- (xiii) the BC earned income benefit;
- (xiv) money paid or payable under the 1986-1990 Hepatitis C Settlement Agreement made June 15, 1999, except money paid or payable under section 4.02 or 6.01 of Schedule A or of Schedule B of that agreement;
- (xv) a rent subsidy provided by the provincial government, or by a council, board, society or governmental agency that administers rent subsidies from the provincial government;
- (xvi) Repealed. [B.C. Reg. 197/2012, Sch. 2, s. 11 (a).]
- (xvii) money paid or payable to a person in settlement of a claim of abuse at an Indian residential school, except money paid or payable as income replacement in the settlement;
- (xviii) post adoption assistance payments provided under section 28 (1) or 30.1 of the Adoption Regulation, B.C. Reg. 291/96;
- (xix) a rebate of energy or fuel tax provided by the government of Canada, the government of British Columbia, or an agency of either government;
- (xx) money paid by the government of British Columbia, under a written agreement, to a person with disabilities or to a trustee for the benefit of a person with disabilities to enable the person with disabilities to live in the community instead of in an institution;
- (xxi) Repealed. [B.C. Reg. 85/2012, Sch. 2, s. 7.]
- (xxii) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under section 8 [*agreement with child's kin and others*] of the *Child, Family and Community Service Act*;
- (xxiii) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under the Ministry of Children and Family Development's At Home Program;
- (xxiv) Repealed. [B.C. Reg. 85/2012, Sch. 2, s. 7.]
- (xxv) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under an agreement referred to in section 93 (1) (g) (ii) of the *Child, Family and Community Service Act*, for contributions to the support of a child;
- (xxvi) a loan that is
 - (A) not greater than the amount contemplated by the recipient's business plan, accepted by the minister under section 70.1 of this regulation, and
 - (B) received and used for the purposes set out in the business plan;
- (xxvii) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under the Ministry of Children and Family Development's

(A) Autism Funding: Under Age 6 Program, or

(B) Autism Funding: Ages 6 — 18 Program;

(xxviii) Repealed. [B.C. Reg. 148/2015, App. 2, s. 1 (a).]

(xxix) payments made by a health authority or a contractor of a health authority to a recipient, who is a "person with a mental disorder" as defined in section 1 of the *Mental Health Act*, for the purpose of supporting the recipient in participating in a volunteer program or in a mental health or addictions rehabilitation program;

(xxx) a refund provided under Plan I as established under the Drug Plans Regulation;

(xxxi) payments provided by Community Living BC to assist with travel expenses for a recipient in the family unit to attend a self-help skills program, or a supported work placement program, approved by Community Living BC;

(xxxii) a Universal Child Care Benefit provided under the *Universal Child Care Benefit Act* (Canada);

(xxxiii) money paid by the government of Canada, under a settlement agreement, to persons who contracted Hepatitis C by receiving blood or blood products in Canada prior to 1986 or after July 1, 1990, except money paid under that agreement as income replacement;

(xxxiv) money withdrawn from a registered disability savings plan;

(xxxv) a working income tax benefit provided under the *Income Tax Act* (Canada);

(xxxvi) Repealed. [B.C. Reg. 180/2010, s. 2 (b).]

(xxxvii) the climate action dividend under section 13.02 of the *Income Tax Act*;

(xxxviii) money paid or payable to a person under the *Criminal Injury Compensation Act* as compensation for non-pecuniary loss or damage for pain, suffering mental or emotional trauma, humiliation or inconvenience that occurred when the person was under 19 years of age;

(xxxix) money that is paid or payable to or for a person if the payment is in accordance with the settlement agreement approved by the Supreme Court in Action No. S024338, Vancouver Registry;

(xl) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under the Ministry of Children and Family Development's Family Support Services program;

(xli) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under the Ministry of Children and Family Development's Supported Child Development program;

(xlii) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under the Ministry of Children and Family Development's Aboriginal Supported Child Development program;

(xliii) money paid or payable from a fund that is established by the government of British Columbia, the government of Canada and the City of Vancouver in relation to recommendation 3.2 of the final report of the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry;

(xliv) payments granted by the government of British Columbia under the Temporary Education Support for Parents program;

(xlv) a BC early childhood tax benefit;

(xlvi) child support;

(xlvii) orphan's benefits under the *Canada Pension Plan Act* (Canada);

(xlviii) money or other value received, by will or as the result of intestacy, from the estate of a deceased person;

(xlix) gifts;

(l) education and training allowances, grants, bursaries or scholarships, other than student financial assistance;

(li) money withdrawn from a registered education savings plan;

(lii) compensation paid or payable under section 17 [*compensation in fatal cases*] or 18 [*addition to payments*] of the *Workers Compensation Act* to a dependant, as defined in section 1 of that Act, who is a child, as defined in section 17 of that Act;

(liii) money that is paid or payable by or for Community Living BC to or for a person if the payment is in accordance with an award in a legal proceeding or with a settlement agreement in respect of a claim for injury, loss or damage caused by Community Living BC, an employee of Community Living BC or a person retained under a contract to perform services for Community Living BC;

(liv) money that is paid or payable by the government of British Columbia to or for a person if the payment is in accordance with an award in a legal proceeding or with a settlement agreement in respect of a claim for injury, loss or damage caused by the minister, the ministry, an employee of the ministry or a person retained under a contract to perform services for the ministry;

(lv) a disabled contributor's child's benefit paid or payable under the *Canada Pension Plan*;

(lvi) payments granted under an agreement referred to in section 94 of the *Child, Family and Community Service Act*;

(lvii) money that is paid or payable, in respect of a child, from property that comes into the control of, or is held by, the Public Guardian and Trustee,

(b) any amount garnished, attached, seized, deducted or set off from income is considered to be income, except the deductions permitted under sections 2 and 6,

(c) all earned income must be included, except the deductions permitted under section 2 and any earned income exempted under sections 3 and 4, and

(d) all unearned income must be included, except the deductions permitted under section 6 and any income exempted under sections 3, 7 and 8.

Deductions from unearned income

6 The only deductions permitted from unearned income are the following:

(a) any income tax deducted at source from employment insurance benefits;

(b) essential operating costs of renting self-contained suites.

Exemptions — unearned income

7 (0.1) In this section:

"disability-related cost" means a disability-related cost referred to in paragraph (a), (b), (c) or (e) of the definition of disability-related cost in section 12 (1) [*assets held in trust for person with disabilities*] of this regulation;

"disability-related cost to promote independence" means a disability-related cost referred to in paragraph (d) of the definition of disability-related cost in section 12 (1) of this regulation;

"intended registered disability savings plan or trust", in relation to a person referred to in section 12.1 (2) [*temporary exemption of assets for person with disabilities or person receiving special care*] of this regulation, means an asset, received by the person, to which the exemption under that section applies;

"structured settlement annuity payment" means a payment referred to in subsection (2) (b) (iii) made under the annuity contract referred to in that subsection.

(1) The following unearned income is exempt:

(a) the portion of interest from a mortgage on, or agreement for sale of, the family unit's previous place of residence if the interest is required for the amount owing on the purchase or rental of the family unit's current place of residence;

(b) \$50 of each monthly Federal Department of Veterans Affairs benefits paid to any person in the family unit;

(c) a criminal injury compensation award or other award, except the amount that would cause the family unit's assets to exceed, at the time the award is received, the limit applicable under section 10 [asset limits] of this regulation;

(d) a payment made from a trust to or on behalf of a person referred to in section 12 (1) [assets held in trust for person with disabilities] of this regulation if the payment is applied exclusively to or used exclusively for

- (i) disability-related costs,
- (ii) the acquisition of a family unit's place of residence,
- (iii) a registered education savings plan, or
- (iv) a registered disability savings plan;

(d.1) subject to subsection (2), a structured settlement annuity payment made to a person referred to in section 12 (1) of this regulation if the payment is applied exclusively to or used exclusively for an item referred to in subparagraph (i), (ii), (iii) or (iv) of paragraph (d) of this subsection;

(d.2) money expended by a person referred to in section 12.1 (2) [temporary exemption of assets for person with disabilities or person receiving special care] of this regulation from an intended registered disability savings plan or trust if the money is applied exclusively to or used exclusively for disability-related costs;

(d.3) any of the following if applied exclusively to or used exclusively for disability-related costs to promote independence:

- (i) a payment made from a trust to or on behalf of a person referred to in section 12 (1) of this regulation;
- (ii) a structured settlement annuity payment that, subject to subsection (2), is made to a person referred to in section 12 (1) of this regulation;
- (iii) money expended by a person referred to in section 12.1 (2) of this regulation from an intended registered disability savings plan or trust;

(e) the portion of Canada Pension Plan Benefits that is calculated by the formula $(A-B) \times C$, where

- A = the gross monthly amount of Canada Pension Plan Benefits received by an applicant or recipient;
- B = (i) in respect of a family unit comprised of a sole applicant or a sole recipient with no dependent children, 1/12 of the amount determined under section 118 (1) of the *Income Tax Act* (Canada) as adjusted under section 117.1 of that Act,
(ii) in respect of any other family unit, the amount under subparagraph (i), plus 1/12 of the amount resulting from the calculation under section 118 (1) (a) (ii) of the *Income Tax Act* (Canada) as adjusted under section 117.1 of that Act;
- C = the sum of the percentages of taxable amounts set out under section 117 (2) (a) of the *Income Tax Act* (Canada) and section 4.1 (1) (a) of the *Income Tax Act*,

(f) a tax refund;

(g) a benefit paid under section 22, 23 or 23.2 of the *Employment Insurance Act* (Canada) to any person in the family unit.

(2) Subsection (1) (d.1) and (d.3) (ii) applies in respect of a person only if

(a) the person has entered into a settlement agreement with the defendant in relation to a claim for damages in respect of personal injury or death, and

(b) the settlement agreement requires the defendant to

- (i) make periodic payments to the person for a fixed term or the life of the person,
- (ii) purchase a single premium annuity contract that

(A) is not assignable, commutable or transferable, and

(B) is designed to produce payments equal to the amounts, and at the times, specified in the settlement agreement,

(iii) make an irrevocable direction to the issuer of the annuity contract to make all payments under that annuity contract directly to the person, and

(iv) remain liable to make the payments required by the settlement agreement.

The appellant's position is that he does not dispute that the ministry's policy is to deduct CPP benefits from disability assistance; he is asking for an exemption based on hardship. The appellant argued that if he were able to work, his earnings would be exempt up to \$9,600 per year. Why, since CPP benefits are derived from employment, are they not also exempt? The appellant argued that he is unable to live on the amount of his disability assistance.

The ministry's position is that CPP benefits of all types or classes are defined as unearned income in the legislation and are subject to deduction from disability assistance, with no applicable exemption listed in the legislation.

Panel decision

Section 1(1) of the EAPWDR defines any type or class of CPP benefits as "unearned income". Section 24, EAPWDR requires that the amount of disability assistance that may be provided to a family unit is calculated by subtracting the family unit's net income calculated under Schedule B from the amount of disability assistance calculated under Schedule A. Schedule B, EAPWDR lists the exemptions from income and the exemptions from unearned income, however none apply to the appellant's CPP benefits. The Panel finds that the ministry reasonably determined that the appellant's CPP benefits must be deducted from his disability assistance.

Section 9, EAPWDR states that a family unit is not eligible for disability assistance if the net income of the family unit determined under Schedule B equals or exceeds the amount of disability assistance determined under Schedule A for that family unit. As the lump sum payment received by the appellant exceeded his monthly disability assistance for the month of September, the Panel finds that the ministry reasonably determined that the appellant was not eligible for disability assistance for that month. The Panel notes that the requirement to define CPP benefits as unearned income and to deduct them from disability assistance is found in legislation, not ministry policy, and there is no provision to exercise discretion, regardless of circumstances.

The Panel finds that the ministry's decision to deduct the appellant's CPP benefits from his disability assistance was a reasonable application of the applicable enactment. The Panel confirms the ministry decision. The appellant is not successful on appeal.